

## POLITICAL SCIENCE 3GG3: FEDERALISM Winter 2021

**Instructor:** Peter Graefe  
**Email:** graefep@mcmaster.ca  
**Lecture:** Tuesday 2:30-4:20 online;  
Friday, Asynchronous

**Office:** [Zoom](#)  
**Office Hours:** Tuesday 4:20-5pm

### Contents

Course Description.....	2
Course Objectives.....	2
Required Materials and Texts .....	3
Class Format.....	3
Course Evaluation – Overview .....	3
Course Evaluation – Details .....	3
Provincial Context Paper, (15%), due February 22 .....	3
Provincial Strategy Paper, (15%), due March 15.....	4
Simulation Reflection Paper, (25%), due April 6.....	4
Simulation Participation, (10%).....	4
Final Exam, (35%), April 2021 .....	4
Weekly Course Schedule and Required Readings .....	4
Week 1 (January 12) .....	4
Week 2 (January 19) .....	4
Week 3 (January 26) .....	4
Week 4 (February 2).....	5
Week 5 (February 9).....	6
Week 6 (February 16).....	6
Week 7 (February 23).....	6
Week 8 (March 2) .....	7
Week 9 (March 9) .....	7
Week 10 (March 16) .....	8
Week 11 (March 23) .....	9
Week 12 (March 30) .....	9
Week 12 (April 6).....	9

Week 14 (April 13) .....	10
Course Policies .....	10
Submission of Assignments.....	10
Grades.....	10
Late Assignments .....	11
University Policies .....	11
Absences, Missed Work, Illness .....	11
Courses with an On-Line Element .....	11
Online Proctoring.....	11
Authenticity / Plagiarism Detection .....	11
Copyright and Recording .....	12
Academic Accommodation for Religious, Indigenous or Spiritual Observances (RISO) .....	12
Academic Integrity Statement.....	12
Conduct Expectations.....	13
Academic Accommodation of Students with Disabilities.....	13
Faculty of Social Sciences E-mail Communication Policy .....	13
Course Modification .....	13
Extreme Circumstances.....	14

## **Course Description**

From the calendar: An analysis of the constitutional framework, evolution, and structure of the federal system in Canada and/or other Western countries.

The principles of federalism at least rhetorically inform the political systems under which two in five humans live. Formal federations such as Canada are institutionally structured in part to protect or give expression to such principles. This course pays particular attention to how these principles have been translated into Canadian political institutions, and the implications for political practices such as redistribution, intergovernmental relations, public policy making, and the accommodation of national diversity.

## **Course Objectives**

By the end of the course students should be able to:

- Explain in what ways Canada is a federation, and to relate these to common conceptual distinctions in federal studies;
- Describe the evolution of the federal features of Canadian politics;
- Explain how public policy-making is shaped by federalism;
- Analyze the competing pressures in an intergovernmental negotiation, and apply class learning to create appropriate bargaining strategies;
- Evaluate the capacity of federalism in Canada to respond to claims arising from a multinational polity.

### **Required Materials and Texts**

Class materials are mostly available on-line through the library website or directly from a hyperlink in this outline. The remainder will be available on the course's Avenue page.

In order to ensure the effective running of synchronous class meetings, students should log in using their official McMaster Zoom account. If a student does not have such an account, they should acquire one from the link on the [UTS Zoom page](#).

### **Class Format**

Each Friday, lectures for the coming week will be posted on Avenue. That material will form the basis of class questions and class discussions on Tuesday from 2:30-3:20. This section of Tuesday's class will be audio-recorded for those unable to attend. Most Tuesday classes will also have time devoted for groups to meet (3:30-4:20) in order to plan and assemble their group work. Groups will be assigned by the instructor at the close of the drop/add period in January via random assignment.

### **Course Evaluation – Overview**

1. Provincial Context Paper – 15%, due February 22
2. Provincial Strategy Paper – 15%, due March 15
3. Simulation Reflection Paper – 25%, due April 6
4. Simulation Participation – 10%
5. Final Exam – 35%, scheduled by the Registrar

### **Course Evaluation – Details**

#### **Provincial Context Paper, (15%), due February 22**

Please see the detailed description on the Avenue Course page. This assignment will be completed as part of your provincial group and submitted collectively. This paper will provide a 10-15 page (double spaced) assessment of the province's historical and contemporary positioning in intergovernmental relations.

### **Provincial Strategy Paper, (15%), due March 15**

Please see the detailed description on the Avenue Course page. This 12-15 page assignment (double-spaced) will be completed with your provincial group and submitted collectively. It will include four parts: an opening speech, two policy field strategy analyses, and an overall provincial strategy analysis.

### **Simulation Reflection Paper, (25%), due April 6**

Please see the detailed description on the Avenue Course page. This 7-9 page paper (double-spaced) involves reflecting on lessons learned from the simulation, and the discussion of these lessons in dialogue with assigned readings and course content.

### **Simulation Participation, (10%)**

Please see the detailed description on the Avenue Course page. This grade will be a composite of self-assessment and instructor assessment of participation during the simulation, including at the preparatory group meetings.

### **Final Exam, (35%), April 2021**

The final exam will be scheduled by the registrar in the final exam period and will take the form of a take-home exam. Questions will be closely tied to the weekly learning outcomes.

## **Weekly Course Schedule and Required Readings**

### **Week 1 (January 12)**

**January 12: Introduction**

### **Week 2 (January 19)**

**January 19 – What is federalism?**

Readings:

Ronald L. Watts, [\*The Federal Ideal and Its Contemporary Relevance\*](#). Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 2007.

Learning Outcomes:

Describe the features that make a political community a federation.

Distinguish federations from other forms such as unitary states or confederations.

Discuss the conditions that account for the waxing and waning of interest in federalism as a solution to political problems.

### **Week 3 (January 26)**

**January 26: Normative and Theoretical Issues**

Readings:

John McGarry, “Federal Political Systems and the Accommodation of National Minorities,” in *Handbook of Federal Countries 2002* (Ottawa: Forum of Federations, 2002), 416-47.

Christine Forster, “[Gender Equality and Federalism](#).” *50 Shades of Federalism* blog, 2018.

Learning Outcomes:

Distinguish between models of territorial and cultural/multinational federalism; of coming together and holding together federalism; of constitutional and treaty federalism.

Describe the arguments for and against using federalism to accommodate national minorities, and evaluate their relative merits.

Compare the arguments that see federalism as positive for reaching gender equality and those that see it as a blockage to gender equality.

### **January 26: First meeting of groups, discussion of simulation**

Simulation reading: Richard Simeon, *Federal-Provincial Diplomacy: The Making of Recent Policy in Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006 [1971]), ch. 8 and 9. This reading is essential for understanding the context of intergovernmental relations that we will be simulating. It is likely also useful for writing your reflection papers. It should be completed by week 7.

## **Week 4 (February 2)**

### **February 2: Historical Development of Canadian Federalism 1**

Readings:

Eugénie Brouillet, “The Negation of a Nation: The Quebec Cultural Identity and Canadian Federalism.” In David Cameron, Jacqueline Krikorian, Robert Vipond, Marcel Martel and Andrew McDougall (eds.) *Roads to Confederation: The Making of Canada 1867*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2017. 40-67.

Peter Russell, *Constitutional Odyssey* 2<sup>nd</sup> Ed. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1993), ch. 4.

Learning Outcomes:

Explain why federal features were included in the 1867 Constitution.

Describe why the 1867 Constitution was considered “quasi-federal”.

Evaluate the relative contribution of the JCPC to the retreat of Macdonald’s centralist design compared to other causes named in the literature.

### **February 2: Groups meet to divide tasks and plan**

## **Week 5 (February 9)**

### **February 9: Historical Development of Canadian Federalism 2**

Readings:

Adam Harmes, *The Politics of Fiscal Federalism: Neoliberalism versus social democracy in multilevel governance* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2019), chapter 5.

André Lecours, "Dynamic De/Centralization in Canada, 1867–2010," *Publius: The Journal of Federalism*, 49:1 (2019), 57-83.

Learning Outcomes:

Explain why the federal spending power has been seen as illegitimate by successive Quebec governments since at least the 1950s.

Explain why Canadian federalism moved from a more cooperative to a more competitive basis from the 1950s to the 1980s.

Evaluate whether Canadian federalism has become more centralized or less centralized since the 1950s, and assess which causes were most important in this change.

**February 9: Groups meet to assemble the first draft of their context paper.  
Context paper due February 22**

## **Week 6 (February 16)**

**Reading Week: No Class**

## **Week 7 (February 23)**

### **February 23: Executive Federalism and Intergovernmental Relations**

Readings:

Jennifer Wallner, [\*19<sup>th</sup> Century Division of Powers, 21<sup>st</sup> Century Problems: Understanding Canadian Intergovernmental Relations\*](#). Montreal: The Federal Idea, 2014.

Robert Schertzer, Andrew McDougall, Grace Skogstad, "Multilateral Collaboration in Canadian Intergovernmental Relations: The Role of Procedural and Reciprocal Norms," *Publius: The Journal of Federalism*, 48:4 (2018) 636-663.

Linda White, "Federalism and Intergovernmental Relations: Prospects for a more Gender Equal Canada." In Manon Tremblay and Joana Everitt (eds.) *The Palgrave Handbook of Gender, Sexuality, and Canadian Politics*. New York: Palgrave, 2020. 147-166.

Learning Outcomes:

Compare the character of intergovernmental relations across policy fields, and explain the causes of differences between fields.

Describe the sources of conflict and cooperation in intergovernmental relations and assess what reforms might produce better outcomes.

Compare Linda White's discussion of federalism and gender equality with Christine Forster's from Week 3.

Notes: **February 23: Groups begin to plan and prepare strategy paper**

**Week 8 (March 2)**

**March 2: Fiscal Federalism**

Readings:

Daniel Béland, André Lecours, Gregory P. Marchildon, Haizhen Mou and M. Rose Olfert, *Fiscal Federalism and Equalization Policy in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2017. Ch. 2.

Alain Noël, "Balance and Imbalance in the Division of Financial Resources." In Alain-G. Gagnon (ed.) *Contemporary Canadian Federalism: Foundations, Traditions, Institutions*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2009), 273-302.

Trevor Tombe, "[Who 'Pays' and Who 'Receives' in Confederation?](#)" *Finances of the Nation*. November 17, 2020.

Learning Outcomes:

Describe and distinguish horizontal and vertical fiscal imbalances, and explain how the equalization programme and federal-provincial transfers relate to horizontal and vertical fiscal imbalances.

Evaluate whether provincial claims for changes in fiscal federalism reflect normative principles or short-term self-interest.

Apply Adam Harmes' arguments to evaluate whether Quebec nationalists' preferences on fiscal federalism share more in common with conservatives or social democrats.

**March 2: Groups meet to share information about their policy area and their government's general position**

**Week 9 (March 9)**

**March 9: Federalism and the Social Union**

Readings:

Peter Graefe, "Social Policy Administration in the Canadian Federation" In *Oxford International Handbook of Public Administration for Social Policy: Promising*

*Practices and Emerging Challenges*, edited by Karen Baehler et al. (forthcoming: Paper available on Avenue.

Tammy Findlay, "Fiscal Federalism and Social Struggle: Social Policy Activism in Canada." Paper presented at the 2013 Annual Meeting of the Canadian Political Science Association. University of Victoria, June 4, 2013.

Donna E. Wood and Thomas Klassen, "Accountability Regimes in federal-provincial Labour Market Agreements 1995-2015." *Canadian Public Administration* 60:1 (2017) 7-27.

Learning Outcomes:

Explain how the spending power is related to social citizenship in Canada.

Evaluate whether hierarchy is necessary in order to develop accountability in intergovernmental policy-making.

Assess the extent to which the institutions of federalism stifle, encourage or otherwise shape the development of social policies in Canada.

### **March 9: Groups review their draft Strategy paper**

## **Week 10 (March 16)**

### **March 16: Federalism and the Energy-Environmental Union**

Readings:

Monica Gattinger, "A National Energy Strategy for Canada: Golden Age or Golden Cage of Energy Federalism?" In Loleen Berdahl, André Juneau and Carolyn Hughes Tuohy (eds.) *Canada: The State of the Federation 2012*. Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 2015. 39-70.

Mark Winfield and Douglas Macdonald, "Federalism and Canadian Climate Change Policy." In Herman Bakvis and Grace Skogstad (eds.) *Canadian Federalism: Performance, Effectiveness and Legitimacy*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Ed. Toronto: Oxford 2020. 363-392.

Learning Outcomes:

Apply Gattinger's and Winfield & Macdonald's articles to understand recent intergovernmental disputes over carbon taxes and pipelines.

Explain the sources of intergovernmental conflict and consensus in these policy areas and evaluate the possibility of developing robust public policies in these areas.

### **March 16: Start of Simulation: Opening Speeches**

Notes: Strategy Paper Due March 15

## **Week 11 (March 23)**

### **March 23: Simulation: Entire class time**

#### Learning Outcomes:

Describe the factors that shape provincial strategies in intergovernmental negotiations. Explain how constitutional and institutional factors create bargaining dynamics that affect the development of intergovernmental consensuses and agreements.

## **Week 12 (March 30)**

### **March 30: Federalism and Plurinationalism: Minority Nations**

#### Readings:

André Lecours, [\*Multinationalism and Accommodation: Analysis of a Canadian Success\*](#). Montreal: The Federal Idea, 2014.

Karlo Basta, "The State between Minority and Majority Nationalism: Decentralization, Symbolic Recognition, and Secessionist Crises in Spain and Canada," *Publius: The Journal of Federalism*, 48:1 (2017) 51–75.

Alain-G. Gagnon, *Minority Nations in the Age of Uncertainty: New Paths to National Emancipation and Empowerment*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2014, p. 72-81.

#### Learning Outcomes:

Describe and compare the strategies used by the central state to recognize or contain the claims of national minorities.

Compare André Lecours and Karlo Basta's arguments about central state responses to minority nations and evaluate whether recognition necessarily leads to secession.

Compare Gagnon's perspective on relations between minority and majority nations with those of Lecours and Basta, and evaluate their respective strengths.

Analyze the normative implications of particular forms of accommodation for freedom and democracy in plurinational societies.

## **Week 12 (April 6)**

### **April 6: Federalism and Plurinationalism: Indigenous Peoples**

#### Readings:

Gina Starblanket, "The Numbered Treaties and The Politics of Incoherency." *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 52:3 (2019): 443-459.

Martin Papillon, "Nation to Nation? Canadian Federalism and Indigenous Multi-level Governance." In Herman Bakvis and Grace Skogstad (eds.) *Canadian Federalism: Performance, Effectiveness and Legitimacy*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Ed. Toronto: Oxford 2020, 395-426.

Notes: Reflection paper due April 6.

Learning Outcomes:

Describe the various proposals for integrating Indigenous peoples into the institutions and practices of Canadian federalism.

Describe how processes of decolonization interact with the institutions of Canadian federalism.

Compare the idea of “treaty federalism” or nation-to-nation relationships with their implementation to date.

**Week 14 (April 13)**

**April 13: Course conclusions and review**

Readings:

John McGarry and Brendan O’Leary, “Must Pluri-national Federations Fail?” *Ethnopolitics* 8:1 (2009), 5-25.

Alain Noël, “[Recognition and New Arrangements: The Challenges of a Multinational Federation](#).” Inaugural Essay Series, Centre of Excellence on the Canadian Federation. September 25, 2020.

Learning Outcomes:

Describe the arguments for and against using federalism to accommodate national minorities, and evaluate their relative merits.

**Course Policies**

**Submission of Assignments**

Papers are to be submitted to the appropriate submissions folder on the course’s Avenue to Learn page by **11:59 pm** on the due date.

**Grades**

Grades will be based on the McMaster University grading scale:

<b>MARK</b>	<b>GRADE</b>
90-100	A+
85-90	A
80-84	A-
77-79	B+
73-76	B
70-72	B-
67-69	C+
63-66	C
60-62	C-
57-59	D+
53-56	D

<b>MARK</b>	<b>GRADE</b>
50-52	D-
0-49	F

### **Late Assignments**

Four days grace will be given for late simulation reflection papers, in order to accommodate the common reasons for late submission, including those giving rise to the use of the MSAF. After four days, the assignments will be assessed a penalty of 2 percentage points per day, including each day of a weekend. The Provincial Context Paper and the Provincial Strategy Paper must be submitted on time. If there are reasons why it is incomplete (for instance, someone fell ill at the last minute), this needs to be explained in a covering note making clear what material is missing as a result.

### **University Policies**

#### **Absences, Missed Work, Illness**

McMaster Student Absence Form (MSAF): In the event of an absence for medical or other reasons, students should review and follow the Academic Regulation in the Undergraduate Calendar “Requests for Relief for Missed Academic Term Work”.

#### **Courses with an On-Line Element**

Some courses may use on-line elements (e.g. e-mail, Avenue to Learn (A2L), LearnLink, web pages, capa, Moodle, ThinkingCap, etc.). Students should be aware that, when they access the electronic components of a course using these elements, private information such as first and last names, user names for the McMaster e-mail accounts, and program affiliation may become apparent to all other students in the same course. The available information is dependent on the technology used. Continuation in a course that uses on-line elements will be deemed consent to this disclosure. If you have any questions or concerns about such disclosure please discuss this with the course instructor.

#### **Online Proctoring**

Some courses may use online proctoring software for tests and exams. This software may require students to turn on their video camera, present identification, monitor and record their computer activities, and/or lock/restrict their browser or other applications/software during tests or exams. This software may be required to be installed before the test/exam begins.

#### **Authenticity / Plagiarism Detection**

Some courses may use a web-based service (Turnitin.com) to reveal authenticity and ownership of student submitted work. For courses using such software, students will be expected to submit their work electronically either directly to Turnitin.com or via an online learning platform (e.g. A2L, etc.) using plagiarism detection (a service supported by Turnitin.com) so it can be checked for academic dishonesty.

Students who do not wish their work to be submitted through the plagiarism detection software must inform the Instructor before the assignment is due. No penalty will be assigned to a student who does not submit work to the plagiarism detection software. **All submitted work is subject to normal verification that standards of academic integrity have been upheld** (e.g., on-line search, other software, etc.). For more details about McMaster's use of Turnitin.com please go to [www.mcmaster.ca/academicintegrity](http://www.mcmaster.ca/academicintegrity).

### **Copyright and Recording**

Students are advised that lectures, demonstrations, performances, and any other course material provided by an instructor include copyright protected works. The Copyright Act and copyright law protect every original literary, dramatic, musical and artistic work, **including lectures** by University instructors

The recording of lectures, tutorials, or other methods of instruction may occur during a course. Recording may be done by either the instructor for the purpose of authorized distribution, or by a student for the purpose of personal study. Students should be aware that their voice and/or image may be recorded by others during the class. Please speak with the instructor if this is a concern for you.

### **Academic Accommodation for Religious, Indigenous or Spiritual Observances (RISO)**

Students requiring academic accommodation based on religious, indigenous or spiritual observances should follow the procedures set out in the [RISO](#) policy. Students should submit their request to their Faculty Office **normally within 10 working days** of the beginning of term in which they anticipate a need for accommodation or to the Registrar's Office prior to their examinations. Students should also contact their instructors as soon as possible to make alternative arrangements for classes, assignments, and tests.

### **Academic Integrity Statement**

You are expected to exhibit honesty and use ethical behaviour in all aspects of the learning process. Academic credentials you earn are rooted in principles of honesty and academic integrity. **It is your responsibility to understand what constitutes academic dishonesty.**

Academic dishonesty is to knowingly act or fail to act in a way that results or could result in unearned academic credit or advantage. This behaviour can result in serious consequences, e.g. the grade of zero on an assignment, loss of credit with a notation on the transcript (notation reads: "Grade of F assigned for academic dishonesty"), and/or suspension or expulsion from the university. For information on the various types of academic dishonesty please refer to the [Academic Integrity Policy](#), located at <https://secretariat.mcmaster.ca/university-policies-procedures-guidelines/>

The following illustrates only three forms of academic dishonesty:

- plagiarism, e.g. the submission of work that is not one's own or for which other credit has been obtained.
- improper collaboration in group work.
- copying or using unauthorized aids in tests and examinations.

### **Conduct Expectations**

As a McMaster student, you have the right to experience, and the responsibility to demonstrate, respectful and dignified interactions within all of our living, learning and working communities. These expectations are described in the [Code of Student Rights & Responsibilities](#) (the "Code"). All students share the responsibility of maintaining a positive environment for the academic and personal growth of all McMaster community members, **whether in person or online**.

It is essential that students be mindful of their interactions online, as the Code remains in effect in virtual learning environments. The Code applies to any interactions that adversely affect, disrupt, or interfere with reasonable participation in University activities. Student disruptions or behaviours that interfere with university functions on online platforms (e.g. use of Avenue 2 Learn, WebEx or Zoom for delivery), will be taken very seriously and will be investigated. Outcomes may include restriction or removal of the involved students' access to these platforms

### **Academic Accommodation of Students with Disabilities**

Students with disabilities who require academic accommodation must contact [Student Accessibility Services](#) (SAS) at 905-525-9140 ext. 28652 or [sas@mcmaster.ca](mailto:sas@mcmaster.ca) to make arrangements with a Program Coordinator. For further information, consult McMaster University's [Academic Accommodation of Students with Disabilities](#) policy.

### **Faculty of Social Sciences E-mail Communication Policy**

Effective September 1, 2010, it is the policy of the Faculty of Social Sciences that all e-mail communication sent from students to instructors (including TAs), and from students to staff, must originate from the student's own McMaster University e-mail account. This policy protects confidentiality and confirms the identity of the student. It is the student's responsibility to ensure that communication is sent to the university from a McMaster account. If an instructor becomes aware that a communication has come from an alternate address, the instructor may not reply at his or her discretion.

### **Course Modification**

The instructor and university reserve the right to modify elements of the course during the term. The university may change the dates and deadlines for any or all courses in extreme circumstances. If either type of modification becomes necessary, reasonable notice and communication with the students will be given with explanation and the opportunity to comment on changes. It is the responsibility of the student to check

his/her McMaster email and course websites weekly during the term and to note any changes.

### **Extreme Circumstances**

The University reserves the right to change the dates and deadlines for any or all courses in extreme circumstances (e.g., severe weather, labour disruptions, etc.). Changes will be communicated through regular McMaster communication channels, such as McMaster Daily News, A2L and/or McMaster email.